

Heuristic Evaluation of Rechords

1. Problem/Prototype

Rechords allows users to associate memories with songs, save them, and share them with friends or with the general public based on location.

2. Violations Found

1. *H4: Consistency and Standards*; / **Severity: 2** / **found by: A, C, D**

On the “New Rechord” page, the UI element for entering the “Rechord Title...” looks more like a search box than an editable text box. The same can be said about “Enter Your Friend’s Name...” on the “Share with Friend” page. The app should stay consistent with platform standards as to not confuse users on what actions they need to take.

Fix: Use an editable text box UI instead of a search UI.

2. *H6: Recognition rather than recall* found / **Severity: 4** / **by: A, B, C, D**

When viewing a particular rechord, there is not clear instruction around the fact that the card with the “Memory Description” is clickable. As a result, some users may not recognize that there is also a “Rechord Description” associated with each rechord.

Fix: add some sort of icon to show that the card is clickable, and that there is additional information that can be viewed.

3. *H4: Consistency and Standards* / **Severity: 1** / **found by: A, C**



Jetting Joy

The use of the down caret symbol at the top of a particular rechord to navigate back to lists of rechords does not follow standard UI design practice. It is also not intuitive to most users, especially since the way users are entering the page is via a dropdown list.

Fix: Use a symbol that communicates/represents “back” better.

4. *H1: Visibility of System Status* / **Severity: 2** / **found by: B, C, D**

The result of clicking “Add to Location Playlist” is not communicated clearly to the user. It’s not clear to a user how a location playlist can be accessed or whether it’s something that is private to a user or open to the public.

Fix: Add more indicators of location playlists.

5. *H4: Consistency and Standards* / **Severity: 1** / **found by: A, C**

When viewing a location playlist, there are heart buttons next to each to enable users to favorite items. However, items on “My Rechords” page do not have this visualization/button, and users must instead click into the three-dot menu to find the “Favorite” action.

Fix: Add the button to the “My Rechords” lists.

6. H1. Visibility of system status / **Severity: 2 / found by: B, C**
After you are done creating your new record, there is no acknowledgement that the new record has been created and added to the list of existing records, it just simply takes you to your records page with the new record on the top. This might be very personal but after creating a new record it would be more clear that it has been created successfully if the new record showed up at the top of the list in a different color or with New written next to the title as a receipt of the creation of the record. It would also be helpful for a small pop-up box showing up saying that the record has been created successfully instead of simply taking us back to the My Records tab.
7. H8. Aesthetic and minimalist design / **Severity: 1 / found by: B, D**
When creating a new record, in the memory details box it says the text “No Memory Details Available (Add)” which doesn’t seem required as it seems like a lot of unnecessary repetition of text and diminishes the relative visibility. Just saying “Add” instead would have been cleaner and easier for the user to understand.
8. H6. Recognition rather than recall / **Severity: 2 / found by: B**
When accessing one’s previous records, and clicking on a particular record (for example- Jetting Joy) the record description that shows up does not indicate that this is one’s own memory and not someone else’s memory which might be confusing if you close the app and this screen opens up. Maybe add a note in the Record Description saying that it is your record the same way that you can see that it is your friend’s record while looking at their record description.
9. H4. Consistency and standards / **Severity: 2 / found by: B**
In the “My Records” tab, if you click on the drop down option for any of the records all you can see is the name of the song and the memory details (if any) associated with that particular record, there is no mention of the Location and Date, which is specifically asked for while creating a particular record. It is definitely important to provide consistent information about a particular record at all times and add the location and date in this drop down menu.
10. H7. Flexibility and efficiency of use / **Severity: 1 / found by: B**
While accessing your personal records or your friend’s records the list format definitely makes sense, but it would definitely be easier for the user to understand more about the particular record if there was an album cover/ song cover icon next to the title of the record. Hence while scrolling through the list the user would gain a better understanding about the songs behind the records even without clicking on the drop-down option if there was an icon specific to the song next to the title.
11. H1. Visibility of system status / **Severity: 2 / found by: B, D**
In the tab bar in the bottom, the first tab is called “My Records” but once you click on that tab there are 2 options: Personal and Friends. The title “My Records” is seemingly confusing as it suggests that there are only personal records there and it might also be hard for a user to navigate to their friend’s records because of this. Hence instead of saying “My Records” in the tab bar it can be something like “Records Collection” or have another tab for “Friend’s Records” in the tab bar itself (though this might be expensive).
12. H8. Aesthetic and minimalist design / **Severity: 1 / found by: A, B**

The capitalized records titles are often distracting and stand out way too much even compared to the title of the screen (for example- My Records). This choice might affect user's reading time as capitalized words often take longer to read and may confuse the users as to what the title of the screen is or what this screen is supposed to do since their attention is immediately drawn to the capitalized words. Maybe distinguish the titles of the records from the rest of the words on the screen using a different color, different text size or different font.

13. H5. Error Prevention / **Severity: 3 / found by: B**

After clicking share with Friend for a record, it seems like you can add any friend as there is no mention of adding friends anywhere in this medium-fi prototype. From your readme it seems like you will have a database of friends but it is important to add the functionality of adding friends first before you just type in their name and can share your record with them, otherwise the user can type anything in this field. Hence maybe include a "Add Friends" option first before sharing a record with a friend.

14. H1 Visibility of System Status / **Severity: 2 / found by: A**

The very first thing a user sees is the Shazam logo, and it is displayed almost exactly how it is displayed in the actual Shazam app on the home page (even with the same color scheme). First, this is confusing, as it's a design/look taken directly from another app. Secondly, it's not clear how this would function. Shazam doesn't have an API allowing independent developers to drop the Shazam functionality into their own applications. How clicking the Shazam button in this app would then produce the song being listened to is unclear. The process of discovering a song currently being listened to in this application needs to be "demystified" to use an actual solution, like taking you to the app store to download shazam, or removed.

15. H2 Match between System and Real World / **Severity: 3/ found by: A, D**

Each record has the option to "like" or "favorite." However, it's unclear what the consequences of doing this are. Is favoriting only visible to the user, and in this case where do favorited records appear? Is a favorite something which is cumulative (like Instagram) and the favorites of other users are visible to a user? It needs to be made more clear what a user is accomplishing by favoriting a record.

16. H3 User Control and Freedom / **Severity: 2 / found by: A**

Currently the user cannot specify what location playlist they want to share their record to. This could be an issue in a region of dense playlists/unique locations and the user wants to share to one playlist in particular. To fix this, the application should allow the user to specify what location (perhaps in a list of nearby locations) they want to share to.

17. H8 Aesthetic and Minimalist Design / **Severity: 2 / found by: A**

On the "My Records" page, all of the Record titles are in all caps. Although this is probably done because they are titles, it clashes with the rest of the words on the screen which are not all capitalized and overall seems distracting and unnecessary. Also, when you click on the individual records to go to their detail page, only the first letter in the title is capitalized, which is an inconsistency. To fix this, the titles should be made to match the titles on the record details page.

18. H8 Aesthetic and Minimalist Design / **Severity: 1 / found by: A**

In general the application design relies heavily on default iOS buttons and aesthetics. The lists all closely resemble the lists in the default Utilities app that comes installed on iPhones. The buttons when interacting with a record to “edit”, “share” or “Add to location,” etc are default iOS button types and generally reserved for error messages within non-Apple apps. In general, the App could use a personal touch while maintaining a minimalist aesthetic.

19. H7 Flexibility and Efficiency of Use / **Severity: 2 / found by: A**

Although the option to “edit” a record is provided from the “My Records” list screen, this option can’t be accessed once a record has been selected and the user is on the record detail screen. Although the prototype doesn’t currently allow interaction with the edit button, intuitively it seems like it would take you to a screen similar to the current detail screen for a record to make edits. Then it makes more sense for the edit button to be accessible from the detail screen, since the user will want to see the content before they edit.

20. H1 Visibility of System Status / **Severity: 2 / found by: A, B**

On the explore page the first thing it shows is “places you’ve been.” However, it’s not clear if these are the most recent places the user has been, although that is probably the intuitive understanding. However, it could be the places you’ve spent the most time, or some other variation. This field needs a clear label specifying what its contents represent.

21. H2: Match between System and the Real World / **Severity: 2 / found by: A, B, C, D**

It doesn’t seem like users can play an entire location playlist. This is a mismatch between the app language and the real world -- if a list is called a “playlist,” users should be able to play them automatically one after the other.

Fix: Either call the playlist something else, or make the playlist playable.

22. H2 Match between system and the real world / **Severity: 1 / found by: D**

The term “memory details” doesn’t give any hints as to what the user should input in that field -- the term itself seems inaccessible.

Fix: Possibly use a term like “notes” rather than “details,” since notes is understandable as something that is both optional already and additional text information.

23. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design / **Severity: 1 / found by: D**

The text “(optional)” after “memory details” is unnecessary -- you could instead have a form checking system or star the required fields.

Fix: Using the term “notes” for “memory details” communicates the fact that this portion is optional, since “notes” normally carries that connotation in forms like this.

24. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use / **Severity: 2 / found by: C, D**

There is an extra click needed to edit the additional memory details. It makes sense to have another screen to correct location or music, but for the additional details, it takes a lot more time and effort to have a separate screen for it.

Fix: Make the editing of the additional details be in an in-line text box, similar to the one currently implemented, but just shorter and within the form. You might resize it as the user types more text.

25. H5 Error Prevention / **Severity: 3 / found by: D**

Once the additional details have been input, there isn’t any way to proofread what has been written without re-entering the edit mode, since only the first few words are displayed. This could result in many mistakes that the user could have corrected otherwise.

Fix: If the text field were in the same screen and the text was continuously visible, the additional details could be easily proofread.

26. H10 Help and documentation / **Severity: 2 / Found by: D**

In the New Rechord screen, it is not obvious that the search button is being used to search for a song to add by typing in.

Fix: Add a caption to the search button saying that it is being used to search for the song manually by its keywords.

27. H1 Visibility of system status / **Severity: 1 / found by: D**

When searching for a new song to create a rechord, the page doesn't have any header displaying what action the user is in the middle of performing.

Fix: Add a header like "Search for a Song."

28. H10 Help and documentation / **Severity: 2 / found by: D**

When searching for a new song to create a rechord, the user should be notified that they can search for a song title or artist, since searching for a "song" seems a bit too general.

Fix: Instead of saying to search for a song, maybe say that the user can "search by artist, title, etc."

29. H3 User control and freedom / **Severity: 4 / found by: D**

When adding a rechord to a location playlist, there is no way to undo the action, only a button to make the notification go away. If the user has done this by mistake, it should be easy to correct.

Fix: Support an undo button to remove the song from the location playlist.

30. H4 Consistency and standards / **Severity: 3 / found by: D**

When in the My Rechords page, "Edit Memory" leads to editing the additional details of the rechord. "Edit Memory" as a term doesn't seem to correlate with what it is editing. Also, a user might think that tapping this option would allow them to edit the rechord like it had just been created.

Fix: Possibly change this to "Edit Rechord" and go to a screen similar to rechord creation, allowing the song, location, and notes to be changed, or just rename this option to imply that the user is editing the notes of the rechord only.

31. H3 User control and freedom / **Severity: 4 / found by: D**

Once a rechord is created, there doesn't seem to be a way to edit its song or location. Users might have not gotten these fields correct or accidentally pressed the create button too soon during rechord creation.

Fix: Allow users to edit these fields even after creating a rechord.

32. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use / **Severity: 2 / found by: D**

In the My Rechords page, the "..." slide up options don't seem very intuitively grouped together. I would expect each of these options (editing, favoriting, sharing, adding to a playlist) to each have their own icons and buttons. The user would never know to find these commonly used functions in a "..." menu.

Fix: Create separate buttons for each of these actions, and place them in the area of each rechord listing accordingly.

33. H4 Consistency and standards / **Severity: 1 / found by: D**

In the My Rechords page, the filter saying it is sorting the listings by newest is bolded under

“personal” records, but not bolded under friends’ records.

Fix: Bold the filter text under friends’ records.

34. H6 Recognition rather than recall / **Severity: 1 / found by: D**

When viewing friends’ records, there is no visual representation of friends other than their names. It would help the user to be able to see some sort of visual distinguisher between different people’s records.

Fix: Add profile pictures to friends’ record listings.

35. H4 Consistency and standards / **Severity: 2 / found by: D**

When sharing a record with a friend, the additional notes are called “memory description,” whereas in the creation of a record, they are called “memory details.”

Fix: Standardize what this particular field is being called.

36. H3 User control and freedom / **Severity: 3 / found by: D**

When sharing a record with a friend, there is no way to undo the action, only a button to make the notification go away. If the user has done this by mistake, it should be easy to correct.

Fix: Support an undo button to unshare the record with the friend (removing it from their friend record list).

37. H5 Error Prevention / **Severity: 2 / found by: D**

When sharing a record with a friend, the button for sharing still looks like its active even when no recipient has been entered for the record to be shared with. The user should not be able to press the share button if there is no recipient.

Fix: Grey out the button for sharing until a recipient has been added.

38. H2 Match between system and the real world / **Severity: 2 / found by: D**

A list view of all locations in the Explore page seems unintuitive, since they are all locations.

Fix: Implement an additional alternative map view that lists locations as pinpoints.

39. H4 Consistency and standards / **Severity: 1 / found by: D**

When viewing your record in the music playing view, the additional notes are called “memory description,” whereas in the creation of a record, they are called “memory details.”

Fix: Standardize what this particular field is being called.

3. Summary of Violations

| Category | # Viol. (sev 0) | # Viol. (sev 1) | # Viol. (sev 2) | # Viol. (sev 3) | # Viol. (sev 4) | # Viol. (total) |
|----------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| H1: Visibility of Status | 0 | 1 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| H2: Match Sys & World | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 4 |
| H3: User Control | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 4 |
| H4: Consistency | 0 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 8 |
| H5: Error Prevention | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 3 |
| H6: Recognition not Recall | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 3 |
| H7: Efficiency of Use | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| H8: Minimalist Design | 0 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 5 |
| H9: Help Users with Errors | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

| | | | | | | |
|--|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|----------|-----------|
| H10: Documentation | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| Total Violations by Severity | 0 | 12 | 19 | 5 | 3 | 39 |
| Note: check your answer for the green box by making sure the sum of the last column is equal to the sum of the last row (not including the green box) | | | | | | |

4. Evaluation Statistics

| Severity / Evaluator | Evaluator A | Evaluator B | Evaluator C | Evaluator D |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| sev. 0 | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% |
| sev. 1 | 33% | 25% | 0% | 58% |
| sev. 2 | 36% | 36% | 26% | 58% |
| sev. 3 | 20% | 20% | 0% | 80% |
| sev. 4 | 33% | 33% | 20% | 100% |
| total (sev. 3 & 4) | 17% | 17% | 8% | 58% |
| total % (all severity levels) | 33% | 31% | 28% | 64% |

*Note that the bottom rows are *not* calculated by adding the numbers above it.

5. Summary Recommendations

The application introduces a lot of new terminology without much instruction or documentation. It will be very important for users to be able to reference what all of your terms mean. Overall, in terms of aesthetics, the application seems to feel a bit basic, and a part of what we think is giving that feeling is that there isn't enough visual stimulus. For example, there is no cover art to any of the music that is being searched or dealt with, and there aren't any profile pictures for the users. Adding things like these will both give the user more information to see what's going on, and in the case of the album artwork, possibly aid in them accessing their memories associated with the event. This is meant to be a fun, creative, and social application, and the design should reflect that.

In addition, the core mission of the app is to encourage people to capture memories in-the-moment, in-place, and the app currently does not facilitate this because many actions are inefficient. In particular, it takes many steps to complete tasks and create memories, so users wanting to quickly create a "rechorde" in the moment might be discouraged. In order to encourage users to open the app regularly, the process of creating a rechorde should be simplified and displayed more explicitly on the homepage. More detailed editing, sharing, and saving functionality should be available, but should not clutter the flow of this initial flow.

But all that being said, the concept for the app is really interesting and the current high-level design is pretty solid!

Severity Ratings

- 0 - don't agree that this is a usability problem
- 1 - cosmetic problem
- 2 - minor usability problem
- 3 - major usability problem; important to fix
- 4 - usability catastrophe; imperative to fix