Instructor: James Landay

Heuristic Evaluation of [Craving]

1. Problem

Craving is an app that allows for users to easily find, review, and follow various food trucks in their area for easy access to quality food truck food.

2. Violations Found

1. H3 User control and freedom / Severity 3 / Found by: A, B

After clicking the star to "follow" the food truck, you cannot click it again to "unfollow". This functionality should be enabled to allow users to undo a "follow" if they change their mind or accidentally clicFked the star.

Fix: Allow users to unfollow food trucks

2. H3 User control and freedom/ Severity 3 / Found by: A, B

On the main screen, users cannot immediately select a food truck nearby; they must first search for a food truck with a query or time. Users may wish to click on food trucks they see marked on the map, because markers are clearly shown on the first screen.

Fix: Allow users to search food trucks nearby by clicking on markers on the first screen (without having to search for a specific type of food or time first)

3. H4 Consistency and standards / Severity 3 / Found by: A, B, C

The follow button has a star symbol, which in other apps can mean "favorited", instead of "followed". This distinction may be confusing to users as it is unclear what pressing the star will do (and which tab to go to see followed trucks).

Fix: Use a different symbol more akin to "following" (or a button that says "follow")/match the symbol on the navigation bar to the symbol pressed when you "follow" a food truck

4. H3 User control and freedom / Severity 4 / Found by: B

After pressing "Dislike", you cannot undo your "Dislike". This functionality should be enabled in case of user error or if the user changes their mind.

Fix: Allow users to undo a "Dislike"

5. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design/ Severity 1/ Found by: A, B, C

The map has additional markers that do not correspond to food trucks. It is unclear what the purpose of these markers are. Users may click on these markers expecting interactions, since they are of similar design to the food truck markers.

Fix: Remove extraneous map markers

6. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use/ Severity 3/ Found by: B

Food truck profiles cannot be accessed on the Followed menu and cannot be easily accessed on the Visited menu (you need to check in and choose to leave a review to be taken to the profile, though you may want to see the profile when you haven't visited the food truck yet). Due to similarity in design between how food truck information is presented on the Map, Followed, and Visited screens, a user

Instructor: James Landay

may expect to be able to visit a food truck's profile from these menus (to leave a review, show the profile to a friend, see other reviews, etc.)

Fix: Add button to allow users to visit a food truck's profile from the Followed and Visited screens easily (without having to search for the food truck on the map)

7. H1 Visibility of system status / Severity 2 / Found by: A, B

When setting a reminder, the prompt says "24 hours before" without indicating what "before" means. Is this before the next time the food truck opens? Before the food truck closes? When can the user expect to receive the reminder?

Fix: Add more detail about when the reminder will be set for (aka "24 hours before open", "24 hours before close", etc.) and also when the users can expect to receive the reminder (9pm Tues, 11am today, etc.)

8. H6 Recognition rather than recall/ Severity 1/ Found by: B

The reminders screen obscures the food trucks' hours, which means that the users have to recall when the food trucks' hours are (or tap between interfaces). Providing this information when setting a reminder would be useful to let the user set a reminder quickly and help users understand when to expect their reminders.

Fix: Add food truck hours to the reminder screen

9. H4 Consistency and standards / Severity 2/ Found by: A, B, C

It is unclear how the app determines if you've visited a food truck, and, if you have, why you would still need to "Check in". From other parts of the app (such as food truck profiles), it appears that checking in is how you indicate that you've visited a food truck (which makes it unclear why you would check-in on the Visited screen).

Fix: Remove "Check in" as an option on the Visited screen (perhaps change it to a button that links to the food truck's profile instead)

10. H4 Consistency and standards / Severity 2 / Found by: A, B

Checking in from the food truck's profile and clicking "Ok" on the screen that pops up (rewarding points) redirects you to the Visited screen instead of the screen you were previously on. The check in button does not indicate that you will be directed away from the food truck's profile after clicking it, which is confusing.

Fix: Have the "Ok" button redirect you to the page you were previously on

11. H4 Consistency and standards / Severity 2 / Found by: A, B

Checking in gives an option to add a photo or leave a review but redirects to the food truck's profile (instead of being a shortcut to add a photo or leave a review). The functionality does not align with what the text indicates it does.

Fix: Shortcut to the specific features listed (leaving a review with the review field already selected or loading the gallery functionality for photos) or revise the text to indicate that the user will be redirected to the food truck's profile (e.g. "Check out the Profile to leave a review or photo!")

12. H4. Consistency and standards / Severity 1/ Found by: A

Instructor: James Landay

I think that the 'Checked In!" page could be reworked to include more photos or symbols that add to the design. Currently, I don't think that the 'Upload Your photos' and 'add your review' buttons match up with the rest of the app that well, and they could be changed to match it.

Fix: Fix the buttons on the checked in page to match the other buttons on the app

13. H2. Consistency and standards / Severity 3/ Found by: A, B, C

Our team found we had different expectations of what the check-in feature does. My teammates thought it meant it was a prompt to check-in and review a truck while I imagined it as a feature where you check-in to the food truck prior to eating there to skip the line.

Fix: Clarify what a check-in actually is

14. H5 Error prevention / Severity 3 / Found by: A, B

The review field says "find tags to add", which seems to suggest that you can only choose one of the tags in the drop down field. However, the task seems to suggest that you can create your own tag by typing it out (unless the app prefills out all possible tags?). This misalignment, especially if no drop down suggested tags appear (perhaps for a new aspect that was not commented on before) might prevent users from leaving novel reviews that contain information other reviews didn't. Fix: Replace "find tags to add" with "Add your own tag or use a suggested tag" or some other text that indicates that the user can type out their own tag.

15. H1 Visibility of system status / Severity 1 / Found by: B, C

The blue field around friends' reviews does not immediately indicate to the user that the reviews were left by friends. This may be confusing, since it may seem that some reviews are arbitrarily spotlighted (especially since there is no clear system yet as to how friends are added. For example, if you added friends using Facebook, not all friends may be immediately recognizable).

Fix: Separate Friend reviews and Other reviews into their own sections

16. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design / Severity 0 / Found by: B

Food truck information listed on the Visited screen seems to fill up too much space (lots of white space), which could make it annoying to scroll if there is a long list of food trucks. This could also be an issue on the Followed screen.

Fix: Enable a different view, allow for selecting dates to view which food trucks were visited, and/or present the information in a more compact way

17. H6 Recognition not recall /Severity 1/ Found by: B

Having the size of the marker you selected increase did not immediately attract my attention to that marker. It takes some searching to find the marker that has been selected, and using a strong visual indicator could enable users to immediately recognize what location they have selected.

Fix: Add stronger visual indicator for selected marker (maybe use different color for selected marker, larger contrast in size, or highlight only the selected marker instead of all the markers, pr animate towards the marker when it is selected)

18. H5 Error prevention / Severity 1 / Found by: B

Instructor: James Landay

The markers on the map are very large compared to the size of the phone. This could make it hard to see or interact with overlapping markers if food trucks are concentrated in a small area.

Fix: Make markers smaller/make overlapping markers more obvious and/or allow zooming on parts of the map.

19. H1 Visibility of system status / Severity 2 / Found by: B, C

The rewards screen does not have any clear indicators as to what rewards the points are building up to (and at what point they will be received). Without any clear indication what the points being gained are for, the reward system may seem pointless.

Fix: Add flags/milestone markers to indicate at what point value a reward will be received (and the current progress to that reward). It would also be nice to have reminders when you earn points about your progress towards your next reward.

20. H4. Consistency and standards / Severity 1 / Found by: A, C

On the rewards page, I'm not sure what the colors are meaning. It seems that the red color that means that you visited a food truck is the same color as the progress bar on the top of the page.

Fix: Make a consistent color scheme for rewards

21. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design / Severity 0 / Found by: B

The map markers and "followed" icons have halos that detract from seeing the actual shape of the marker and seems to provide unnecessary emphasis on those parts of the interface.

Fix: Only add a "glow" or "halo" for icons that need special emphasis for a task (such as the currently selected marker on the map)

22. H2 Match between system and the real world / Severity 3 / Found by: A, C

When writing tags for a review, it seems that dark blue tags are positive tags and light blue tags are negative tags. This is not intuitive, and I actually had to read the reviews to figure out whether or not they are negative or positive.

Fix: Make the colors of positive and negative reviews more intuitive and/or add identifying iconography for positive and negative reviews

23. H4 Consistency & Standards / Severity 0 / Found by: C

On the Visited and Following views the timestamp header text (today, yesterday, 3 days go) has inconsistent coloring

Fix: Normalize Color Scheme

24. H2 Match between system and the real world / Severity 1/ Found by: A

On the review tags, currently 'enchiladas' is both a negative tag and a positive tag, which doesn't make intuitive sense to me. I love having a difference in color between positive and negative tags, but it might be useful to also include a 'neutral' tag that includes less opinionated information.

Fix: Include a third shade that indicates a 'neutral' tag

25. H8 Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity 1/ Found by: C

Instructor: James Landay

On the screen that pops up after clicking check-in, I don't think the options for adding pictures or leaving reviews is necessary. It makes more sense to have those options available after a user eats, not when they schedule the meal. (Note: This is contingent on check-in having the functionality where you check-in before a meal to skip the line)

Fix: Remove these options or put them somewhere else in the app, perhaps in a pop-up after a user finishes eating somewhere - kind of like what Uber does after the completion of a ride.

26. H8 Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity 3/ Found by: B, C

Having two totally different views for following and visited is somewhat redundant. Both could definitely be consolidated into one app view.

Fix: Further differentiate the purposes and functionality of the two different views or combine them into one view.

27. H3 User control and freedom / Severity 3/ Found by: A

On the reviews page, I really like the use of tags when writing a review on the review page. However, part of me wants to have the choice to write a more robust review if I want to. If I have a really strong opinion about a food truck. I want to be able to show that in addition to tags.

Fix: Allow the user to add a more detailed review in addition to tags

28. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity 3/ Found by: C

I can see a need for easy access to menus on the profile of the truck. Some people go off of pictures but others prefer a textual menu.

Fix: Add a link to view a menu when you select a truck

29. H2. Match between system and the real world /Severity 3/ Found by: A

On the visited page, if I remember correctly when this team presented in class, they said that the dislike button on the visited page will make it so you don't see that food truck anymore. I'm not sure if the term 'dislike' in the way that we use it on apps would lend itself to this behavior.

Fix: Change the wording of 'dislike' to something more specific like 'unfollow'

30. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity 2/ Found by: C

The user is allowed to check-in to a food truck from the Visited page but not from the Following page. Likewise, I can set reminders from Following but not from visited. There should be consistency among features that way a user doesn't keep going to the wrong views expecting certain features that actually belong to other views.

Fix: Normalize which features are available or further differentiate the two different views so a user doesn't get confused over which page does what.

3. Summary of Violations

Category	# Viol.					
	(sev 0)	(sev 1)	(sev 2)	(sev 3)	(sev 4)	(total)
H1: Visibility of Status		1	2			3

Instructor: James Landay

Note: check your answer for the green box by making sure the sum of the last column is equal to the sum of the last row (not including the green box)						
Total Violations by Severity	3	9	6	11	1	30
H10: Documentation						
H9: Help Users with Errors						
H8: Minimalist Design	2	2		1		5
H7: Efficiency of Use				2		2
H6: Recognition not Recall		2				2
H5: Error Prevention		1		1		2
H4: Consistency	1	2	4	1		8
H3: User Control				3	1	4
H2: Match Sys & World		1		3		4

Instructor: James Landay

4. Evaluation Statistics

Severity /	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C	Evaluator D	Evaluator E
Evaluator					
sev. 0	0	67%	33%		
sev. 1	44%	55%	44%		
sev. 2	67%	83%	50%		
sev. 3	82%	64%	45%		
sev. 4	0	100%	0		
total (sev. 3 & 4)	75%	67%	42%		
total (all severity levels)	57%	67%	43%		

^{*}Note that the bottom rows are not calculated by adding the numbers above it.

5. Summary Recommendations

One point of concern is that the Followed and Visited screens feel a little redundant, partially due to their similar design. Adopting a different design for these screens that takes into account the different ways they will be used (such as making the Visited screen significantly more compact in design than the Followed page if people are expected to visit many more food trucks than they follow) would help clarify their purpose (and help differentiate them from each other).

For the reviews page, we mainly just felt like I wanted more flexibility in writing reviews. We love the use of the tags, but we also felt constrained that I could only do that and not write real reviews of my own (I also want to write my own tags if one doesn't exist). The same feeling occurs when we want to read a review too. Sometimes, the tags are all we need, but we would love to be able to view more details of a review by clicking on it so we can get a more in depth analysis of what the person was trying to say. We also think it would be great to see if we could make it more obvious whether or not a review was overall positive or overall negative. You could use colors in one way or another to indicate this to the user. That way, if a user is quickly scrolling through the reviews they can tell if they are overall positive or overall negative.

Regarding Consistency and Standards, many of the violations were centered around colors and iconography. While the color scheme and iconography is for the most part aesthetically appealing, there needs to be more intentionality behind the meanings of both. Of note, the star icon shows up in both Rewards and Following and should probably be restricted to one or the other. The color scheme also tends to change slightly between views without explanation and at times seems arbitrary in nature (e.g. the rewards categories). Solidifying a set of colors and icons that correspond to certain meanings/features will fix this.

We love the use of the gamification, and we think we want to see more of that in the rest of the app. If that's on of the main drivers to get people to use the app, then screens or popups indicating you've gotten points should appear any time that a user does an action that earns

Instructor: James Landay

more points. Also, we think it would be cool if you got more points by being a regular at a certain food truck!

Severity Ratings

- 0 don't agree that this is a usability problem
- 1 cosmetic problem
- 2 minor usability problem
- 3 major usability problem; important to fix
- 4 usability catastrophe; imperative to fix

Instructor: James Landay

Heuristics

H1: Visibility of System Status

• Keep users informed about what is going on

H2: Match Between System & Real World

- Speak the users' language
- Follow real world conventions

H3: User Control & Freedom

- "Exits" for mistaken choices, undo, redo
- Don't force down fixed paths

H4: Consistency & Standards

H5: Error Prevention

H6: Recognition Rather Than Recall

• Make objects, actions, options, & directions visible or easily retrievable

H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use

- Accelerators for experts (e.g., gestures, kb shortcuts)
- Allow users to tailor frequent actions (e.g., macros)

H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design

• No irrelevant information in dialogues

H9: Help Users Recognize, Diagnose, & Recover from Errors

- Error messages in plain language
- Precisely indicate the problem
- Constructively suggest a solution

H10: Help & Documentation

- Easy to search
- Focused on the user's task
- List concrete steps to carry out
- Not too large