

Heuristic Evaluation of Fandom

1. Problem

The UI intends to help fans in a foreign city find like minded individuals and organize events for their favorite team, this including determining fan distribution, viewing events for a certain team, and creating events.

2. Violations Found

1. H1. Visibility of system status / Severity: 3 / Found by: A, C

After selecting a filtering mechanism(team), there is no status message to indicate what the currently selected filter is, which becomes confusing especially on the events view. This could be as simple as having a status message at the top that says “showing events for Giants fans” or something of the like, to make the meaning of flags that are shown more clear.

2. H8. Aesthetic and minimalist design/ Severity: 1 / Found by: B

When a user selects a team to pursue, the interface places an awkward colored square border around the team logo. Although it makes the selection clear, it adds a very cumbersome and rigid object taking away from the rest of the aesthetic. Possible Fix: Instead of using a rigid colored rectangular borderline, increase / decrease the opacity of the logo / relevant rectangle.

3. H8. Aesthetic & Minimalist Design/ Severity: 2 / Found by: C

The seemingly indecisiveness of the designers to go for either a rounded corner or a non-rounded corner UI. Some buttons and elements are rounded whereas others aren't, consistency here will help to make the UI feel more comfortable to use. This is because the user will be able to recognize certain elements and build an intuition for the effect those elements have in the app.

4. H8. Aesthetic & Minimalist Design/ Severity: 1 / Found by: B, C

When in the map view, the tab bar's and navigation bar's colour conflicts with the colour of the map. Consider changing the colour of the tab bar and navigation bar to a distinct colour from the map, maybe the colour of the team selected? Using the selected team's colour, it also minimizes the user's memory load to remember which team was selected because the colour of the team comes back in the UI of the app.

5. H4. Consistency and standards/ Severity: 4 / Found by: A, B

The “filter” icon presented in the top right corner takes the user to the team selection page. The use of the filtering image, which makes it unclear that picking a sport also filters results. Consider changing the icon for the drop menu to resolve this ambiguity—or change both icons to filters with different symbols, for example. Additionally, the default opening interface that shows the distribution of various teams offers the user gains little to no personal value-add from

the page. Considering this, one fix is to open on the team selection page by default which directly involves the user from the start and eliminates the need for the filtering icon completely.

6. H3. User Control & Freedom / Severity: 4 / Found by: A, B, C

There is currently no option to filter for a different set of teams or search for teams that are not listed right now. Further, there is no flexibility in changing the teams that appear on the screen by default, thus the user is stuck to a limited number of teams uncatered to their personal preferences. Further, users can't choose to filter by more than one team. Both searching for other teams and filtering on a subset of teams that's >1 seems crucial to the moderate task ('view events for your team'). To fix this, consider adding a search bar. Another solution would be to allow users to cater the teams listed by default, by either adding a button on this screen or adding a "settings" option within the app.

7. H1. Visibility of system status / Severity: 2 / Found by: A, B

On the team-filtering page, it is unclear which teams are being shown specifically and why. It seems infeasible to display every single team in existence, so one fix could be to display a message such as "teams with fans near by", so that the user knows the filtration method used.

8. H7. Flexibility and efficiency of use / Severity: 1 / Found by: A

For users who frequently search for the same team, there is no sped up process for discovering these teams. This could be improved by adding a "favorite teams" feature or category within the list of teams, that highlights previously searched for teams.

9. H7. Flexibility and efficiency of use / Severity: 2 / Found by: A

There is one option that allows a user to filter results by sport and then another option that allows the user to filter results by team. In order to select by sport and then by team, having to click on the left upper corner, exit out and then click on the right upper corner seems tedious. One fix would be combining the two upper columns so that filtering by sport or by team can be done from the same section.

10. H2. Match between system and real world / Severity: 2 / Found by: A

On the events view, the idea that clicking on a flag will allow a person to see closer up events feels unintuitive, because the flag symbol feels like a symbol whose meaning is hard to understand. It seems like enough information would be provided by just displaying the recognizable location pins, on a map that can be moved and zoomed in to dynamically, and this would also diminish and extra click.

11. H1. Visibility of system status / Severity: 2 / Found by: A

On the events view, it is hard to tell what team events being shown are for, and the time range in which these events are going to occur. Having a feature at the bottom that lets the user toggle the team and time frame could help this problem. Or a simple message that says "showing events for: [team] on [date]" would be extremely helpful.

12. H5. Error prevention / Severity: 4 / Found by: A

Without having selected any team of sport filters, I am able to go to the events page. This should be an error, because my view would show every event for every team and sport. One solution would be to have the “events” tab disabled and a message saying “please select a filter” so that this doesn’t occur.

13. H5. Error Prevention / Severity: 3 / Found by: A

From the “Create Event” screen, there aren’t any checks currently to make sure that the time is a valid time in the future, and that there is not an existing event for another team at the same location. (if this is something that needs to be checked).

14. H3. User Control and Freedom / Severity: 2 / Found by: A

After clicking on a team, there is no “back” button, so it’s not obvious how to get back to the map page. Adding a back button would allow for a clearer “emergency exit” to leave the state.

15. H1. Visibility of system Status / Severity: 3 / Found by: C

The button in the top right corner to pick a team does not let the user see where they are in the app. Whether clicked or unclicked, the button/icon looks the exact same. The user gets no feedback as to whether this button/icon is actually active or not. Consider inverting the colours or fading them a little bit, like done in the Tab Bar.

16. H2: Match b/w System & World / Severity: 2 / Found by: C

The app makes use of the so called ‘Hamburger Menu’ (<https://techcrunch.com/2014/05/24/before-the-hamburger-button-kills-you/>), which is a great way to add layers of interactions to your app and switch between different views. The way the Hamburger Menu is used, by convention of the UI design community, is more as an ‘underlying’ layer of the app. In Fandom, the hamburger is used as a dropdown, which is great, but not what the Hamburger Menu intends as is used like in the world. Since this is such a crucial interaction in the app, maybe make this more central as a circled button, which -when tapped- opens up with possibilities (sports). Consider what the app ‘Path’ does:

<https://i.amz.mshcdn.com/eQuZZFdAHAHUOnUB4VfAi8H3lp4=/fit-in/850x850/http%3A%2F%2Fmashable.com%2Fwp-content%2Fgallery%2Fthe-15-best-social-apps-for-iphone%2FPath.jpg>.

17. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 2 / Found by: C

In the map view (tab 1) it is very clear what area is populated by a certain team and how active that area is. What seems inconsistent is how these areas and their populations relate to the events view (tab 2). It would be great, from a product perspective, to set a standard when it comes to area population by a certain team and how this translates to event. It seems like this is attempted using the orange squares which then means ‘Giants’, but what is sports teams have the same colour? Consider for example using the team’s logo in the flag and making the flag the colour of the team. Setting a standard here for both tabs would be helpful. Especially given the team’s tasks to 1.) Determine Fan Distribution and 2.) View events for your team.

18. H2: Match b/w System & World / Severity: 3 / Found by: C

If we consider the first tab, the map view, there are some things to be changed and improved. First of all, the square grid for the areas of popularity doesn't make sense. Since these events and their popularity won't ever turn out to be squares if you measure their exact location, it would be more intuitive to make it a heat map with "waves" representing the actual influence of an event on its neighboring area. This allows eventually for potentially more interaction and gives the user a fair message and a truthful representation of the situation. This way blending the events and their effect on the popularity in an area. That way, users feel a direct link and influence in attending or creating an event and that way contributing to their team's popularity in an area. It helps gamify Fandom as well. A fix on this violation will help to use the User Interface to bridge task 1 and task 2 more closely together.

19. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 3 / Found by: C

The great correlation and core of the app, seems to view fan distribution (task 1) and then interact with that distribution through events, by either creating new events or viewing/attending them. What is inflexible and inefficient is that these two (or three) tasks are split in the app using a Tab bar at the bottom. The tab bar is normally used to separate two completely different parts of an app (e.g. 'Feed' and 'Profile'), whereas in Fandom's case, the two tabs relate a whole lot to each other. It seems inefficient that the user has to switch between the tabs by viewing fan distribution first and *then* going onto switching to the event view. Why not all in one and interact with the actual populated areas (heatmap)?

20. H5: Error Prevention / Severity: 4/ Found by: C

When the user goes the events view tab and then starts adding an event, there seem to be irrelevant information and possible interactions apparent in the app that could cause potential errors for users. When in the view of creating a new events, the user is able to use the top navigation bar to switch sports *and* to switch teams... For one, that's probably not what a user needs at the moment of creating a new event, and two, what happens if the user does this? There is no communication to me, as a user, whether this changes the sport and team of the event I'm currently creating and would probably provoke a user interface error.

21. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 2/ Found by: B

The interface, specifically the difference in opacity, is not clear about the status of the current fan distribution. It is hard for the user to know what "fan distribution" means. In other words, is it amount of fans based in the area? Amount of fan currently in the area? Density of fan events currently happening in the region? Possible Fix: Have a pop-up clarifying what the difference in opacity symbolizes.

22. H8: Aesthetic and minimalist design /Severity: 3 / Found by: B

The interface uses an awkward icon which is a black flag surrounded by a colored square border to associate a specific team with certain areas where events are held for such team. This might confuse the user to think that the box and flag are either redundant or symbolize different

things. Possible Fix: Instead of using a black flag with an orange box around it, color the flag with the relevant color.

23. H4: Consistency and standards / Severity: 2 / Found by: B

When a user creates a new event, the color used to mark the icon symbolizing the 'new' event is colored. However, such color is not consistent with previous use of color since in other parts of the interface color is suppose to associate icons with teams, yet as shown below, the event created is associated with a game involving two different teams, with two different team colors, leading to user into confusion. Possible Fix: Use another type of way to symbolize the appearance of the 'new' event, i.e. making the icon blink, slow increase in opacity, etc.

24. H7: Flexibility and efficiency of use. / Severity: 3 / Found by: B

The user has no knowledge about the type of events displayed unless he clicks on every single 'location' icon. This leads to a large inconvenience for the user, and various inefficiencies. Possible Fix: Add a filter option so that user are able to filter the various events displayed to a more tailored portrayal of what they are looking for.

25. H8: Aesthetic and minimalist design. / Severity: 4 / Found by: B

As shown in the interface below, the extensive portrayal of various colors while, at the same time, showing the 'sidebar' options leads to a very hectic and exhaustive user experience. Possible Fix: Tone down the colors on the interface when the sidebar is presented to decrease distraction and increase minimalistic feel / experience.

26. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 4 / Found by: B

In none of the interfaces does the user know where they are located relative to the icons displayed on the map. Hence, the user is not able to easily conceptualize his proximity to certain events. One possible fix is to add a 'current location' icon so that the users knows where he is relative to everything.

27. H2: Match between system and the real world / Severity: 3 / Found by: B

The interface uses colored square borders around flags to associate certain teams with areas where events are held. However, various teams overlap colors. Additionally, users identify with logos / symbols more strongly than they would with colors. Possible Fix: Instead of using a black flag with an orange box around it, replace the flag with the specific team logo.

28. H6. Recognition rather than recall / Severity: 2 / Found by: A

To create a new event, the user must click the plus icon. It feels like the plus icon could be replaced with a more descriptive symbol, or have the word “event” situated somewhere near the symbol to jog the user’s memory and make it easier to understand the function.

3. Summary of Violations

Category	# Violations
H1: Visibility of System Status	6
H2: Match b/w System & World	4
H3: User Control & Freedom	2
H4: Consistency & Standards	3
H5: Error Prevention	3
H6: Recognition not Recall	1
H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use	4
H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design	5
H9: Help Users with Errors	0
H10: Help & Documentation	0
Total Violations	28

4. Evaluation Statistics

Severity / Evaluator	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C
Level 0	0%	0%	0%
Level 1	33%	66%	33%
Level 2	55%	27.3%	27.3%
Level 3	25%	37.5%	50%
Level 4	50%	67%	33.3%
Total (levels 3 & 4)	36%	50%	50%
Total (all levels)	40%	42%	41.5%

5. Summary Recommendations

Overall, we believe that the interface was a very neat, well-designed product that allowed to user to achieve all the tasks that the team designed for. Although there are various violations found, the violations are nuanced which will only improve the product as a whole but does not speak to the current quality of the product. As mentioned briefly in one of the descriptions earlier, is the suggestion to get rid of the different tabs. From a more general and task perspective, the UI chosen, namely the tab system, makes it harder for the user to complete the step of tasks: 1.) determine fan distribution, 2.) view events for your team and 3.) create an event. More specifically, the tab system seems to be a barrier between task 1 and tasks 2 and 3. Which is an unnecessary barrier that can easily be fixed by getting rid of the tab system and combining tab 1 and tab 2 together into one map.

Additionally, the attempted use of colors for clarity is a good idea, however can easily be improved by decreasing the over-use of it on certain parts of the interface, as well as, using it more efficiently and less redundantly in other parts. I+At the same time, the lack of original clarification in terms of the meaning of different levels of opacity is unclear and can lead the user to come to various different conclusion that could be wrong, thus adding some kind of basic / minimal documentation would be helpful, explaining the various nuanced features on the interface.

If the map of popularity then becomes a heatmap that actually represents a team’s popularity/distribution in an area based on events and attendance, the users might feel more incentivized to contribute to their team’s popularity/distribution in an area (by attending or creating an event) and thus to the “heat map” in general. By modifying the UI like that, all tasks will be in one place, allowing for easy flow and interaction between the tasks and thus making it easier for the user to complete them while at the same time enhancing the user experience.

This would also be significantly enhanced by adding a 'current location' feature ultimately allowing the user to know where they stand relative to the other fans, events, etc.