

Heuristic Evaluation of Clean Plate

Evaluator #A: Ngoc Bui

Evaluator #B: Eric Hermann

Evaluator #C: Skyler Bonnack Sin

(These names will be removed before the document is given to the project team. Use these letter below)

1. Problem

We're evaluating Team Clean Plate, which developed an app to allow users to easily find leftover food from restaurants to drop off at a local food bank in order to eliminate food waste, and then receive reward coupons at local restaurants for doing so.

2. Violations Found

1. **[H2-1 Visibility of System Status] [severity=3] [found by A, B]**
 - a. On the home screen, it's unclear why I'm looking at a map with my location on it. This may be confusing to users, especially if they are opening up the application for the first time. A general home screen with information about the app and what it does might be helpful.
2. **[H2-1 Visibility of System Status] [severity=3] [found by A, C]**
 - a. On the home screen, it's unclear why I'm looking at a map with my location on it. This may be confusing to users, especially if they are opening up the application for the first time. A general home screen with information about the app and what it does might be helpful.
3. **[H2-1 Visibility of System Status] [severity=2] [found by A, B]**
 - a. When I search for Zola, it appears as a red dot on the screen, which is not immediately recognizable as an indicator that this refers to the location of Zola. A label on the dot saying Zola would make it easier to remember which restaurant I'm to pick up from.
4. **[H2-3: User Control & Freedom] [severity=4] [found by A, B, C]**
 - a. Once a user clicks "Pickup" to pick up the food, there is no way for the user to cancel the trip or notify the restaurant he or she is no longer coming. There is no emergency exit for the user to leave the unwanted state. If the user hits the back button, it is unclear if the trip was cancelled. Put a "Cancel Pickup" button in the top right corner of the screen throughout all steps of the trip.
5. **[H2-3: User Control & Freedom] [severity=4] [found by A, B, C]**
 - a. The call page takes users directly to the phone interface and out of the app; they're trapped there. If a user did not mean to click call, they would have to spend some time getting back to the app. A simple confirmation to let users know they're leaving the app can help prevent this error.
6. **[H2-4: Consistency & Standards] [severity=2] [found by A,B, C]**
 - a. The Interface used the string "Go to Food Bank" to start the delivery portion of the task flow, but later in the same task it used the string "Delivery confirmed!"

and “Waiting for delivery confirmation”. Users may be confused if the string “Go to Food Bank” means the delivery portion of app, when this task is later referred to as delivery in “Delivery confirmed!”. Instead of “Go to Food Bank” make the string “Start Delivery to Food Bank”.

7. **[H2-4: Consistency & standards] [severity=2] [found by A, B]**
 - a. Sometimes your popup confirmations are iOS based (e.g. claim reward, pickup confirmation) and sometimes they’re custom to the design (e.g. all of the navigate to shelter confirmations). Same with the restaurant info page where the call, save, share are google Maps but the pickup is a custom button. It’s best to stick to one of these things (I prefer the custom ones).
8. **[H2-4 Consistency and Standards] [severity=1] [found by B, C]**
 - a. Throughout the app, some words and phrases are capitalized while others (for example “3 bags of food available for pickup” are lowercase, which is inconsistent. Choosing a consistent form and sticking with it would fix this issue.
9. **[H2-6 Recognition rather than Recall] [severity=2] [found by A, C]**
 - a. The search for a restaurant may pose difficult for some users. It might be easier and faster for users to have a list of options based on proximity, amount of food to pick up (which may limit some users), or restaurant type -- categories over search.
10. **[H2-8 Aesthetic and Minimalist Design] [severity=1] [found by B]**
 - a. The “C” of the Clean Plate logo across the top is partially covered by the default time and connectivity information for the phone, which makes it look like it’s not centered in the blue box. Centering the logo vertically in the box would fix this.
11. **[H2-1: Visibility of Status] [severity=3] [found by C]**
 - a. The interface brings the user through all the steps it takes to pick up the food, drop off the food, and collect the reward, but it doesn’t have any status telling the user what step he is currently on. This may confuse the user because the google maps interface looks identical between going to the restaurant and going to the food bank. Add a label at the top of left of the screen that says “Pickup” or “Delivery”.
12. **[H2-4 Consistency and Standards] [severity=3] [found by A, B, C]**
 - a. When I’ve completed a task, it’s unclear if I’m adding the new reward of an ice cream at Scoop or just redeeming that already existing reward. This is inconsistent because it conflicts with the way that the Rewards screen is used from the home menu. To fix this, you could add a section to “Add Rewards” and then add that reward to your list. Another fix is to create a pop-up that tells the user about the new reward available to them or highlight the new reward in the rewards screen after a delivery.
13. **[H2-7 Flexibility and Efficiency of Use] [severity=2] [found by B]**
 - a. To search for a restaurant, the user has to click the tiny return button in the bottom right corner of the keyboard. This isn’t super flexible or efficient since it’s

hard to find and click. Labeling that button more clearly or adding a new, larger button would fix this issue.

14. [H2-7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use] [severity=1] [found by A]

- a. On the restaurant info page, users do not have an option to select how many bags they can pick up. It is assumed they can and must get all available bags. An easy fix is to allow users to select the quantity before selecting pickup.

15. [H2-6 Recognition Rather Than Recall] [severity=3] [found by A, B, C]

- a. On the Rewards menu, dates are listed next to each reward, but it's not clear if that's the date at which the user got the reward or the date by which the reward must be redeemed. This forces the user to remember what day she got that particular reward to figure out what the date means. To fix this, you could write "Redeem by Oct 24" or "Received on Oct 24."

16. [H2-5: Error Prevention] [severity=4] [found by C]

- a. After the the user delivers the food to the food bank, a "Waiting for delivery confirmation" comes up, which is presumably the food bank checking off that food was delivered. However, the user is stuck on this screen forever if somehow the food bank forgets to check off that the delivery was completed. There should be a way to check and account for this likely error. Include a "I just delivered the food" option here that can notify the food bank that they forgot to accept the delivery or at least give the user a way to claim that he delivered food.

17. [H2-4: Consistency & standards] [severity=2] [found by A, B]

- a. The 'navigate to shelter' screens are entirely Google Maps. Though you will have the menu button available in the actual app that still might not be enough to distinguish it and keep with the design of your app. It might be a good idea to layer your design scheme on top of Google Maps and keep Maps in the backend.

18. [H2-7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use] [severity=2] [found by C]

- a. The interface assumes that the user needs directions to the restaurant and food bank he is going to, but an experienced user may go to the same two places very frequently and does not want to go through all the tedious steps involved with opening the map app. The interface should cater to new users who do not know where they are going and people who frequently make the same trips. Include an on/off button in the pick-up and drop-off task flow that will allow the user to turn on and off the maps.

[..list violations here with a blank line between each -- number from 1 to n, where n is total # of violations]

3. Summary of Violations

Category	# Viol. (sev 0)	# Viol. (sev 1)	# Viol. (sev 2)	# Viol. (sev 3)	# Viol. (sev 4)	# Viol. (total)
[H2-1: Visibility of Status]			1	3		
[H2-2: Match Sys & World]						
[H2-3: User Control]					2	

[H2-4: Consistency]		1	3	1		
[H2-5: Error Prevention]					1	
[H2-6: Recognition not Recall]			1	1		
[H2-7: Efficiency of Use]		1	2			
[H2-8: Minimalist Design]		1				
[H2-9: Help Users with Errors]						
[H2-10: Documentation]						
Total Violations by Severity		3	7	5	3	18
Note: check your answer for the green box by making sure the sum of the last column is equal to the sum of the last row (not including the green box)						

4. Evaluation Statistics

Severity / Evaluator	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C		
sev. 0					
sev. 1	1	2	1		
sev. 2	5	5	3		
sev. 3	4	3	4		
sev. 4	2	2	3		
total (sev. 3 & 4)	6	5	7		
total (all severity levels)	12	12	11 :(

5. Summary Recommendations

This all seems pretty negative, but the app overall is really good! Most of the errors found were problems with aesthetics and cleanliness, things like catching spelling errors, making sure all buttons are usable, and making sure things are consistent from screen to screen, which are all easy fixes. To catch these kinds of things, we'd recommend just going through the app and making sure all the buttons do what they say they'll do, that titles are consistent, that buttons exist where they need to exist to give the user optionality, and that everything looks clean.

One major thing we would note is that the app currently takes users in and out of the interface quite a bit between the Maps API and the calling. These external functionalities could be more seamlessly integrated into your design. Presently, it feels as if it was just plopped in as it is. This resulted in a couple of inconsistencies with whether to stick with the design you have for the app or use the external platform's.

The other major thing I noticed is the lack of choice in the app. You have a lot of confirmations but these aren't really flexible choices you're offering the user – it's most binary. I would recommend giving the user more choice and ownership over their deliveries (with finding places, how many bags, where to go, etc).

One general recommendation is to think about possible mishaps that could happen during the pickup and delivery process and how to accommodate those errors. The pick-up and delivery flow may fail due to things such as closures, no food, user becoming busy, user changing his or her mind, food banks need to be switched, etc. The pick-up and delivery flow seems a bit rigid, and it would be nice if there were ways to cancel out or address possible issues that may come up during pick-up and delivery. None of the errors I found were major problems with the functionality or workflow of the app itself, and the design definitely allows a user to easily accomplish their intended goal, which is excellent.

Severity Ratings

- 0 - don't agree that this is a usability problem
- 1 - cosmetic problem
- 2 - minor usability problem
- 3 - major usability problem; important to fix
- 4 - usability catastrophe; imperative to fix

Heuristics

[H2-1: Visibility of System Status]

- keep users informed about what is going on

[H2-2: Match Between System & Real World]

- speak the users' language
- follow real world conventions

[H2-3: User Control & Freedom]

- "exits" for mistaken choices, undo, redo
- don't force down fixed paths

[H2-4: Consistency & Standards]

[H2-5: Error Prevention]

[H2-6: Recognition Rather Than Recall]

- make objects, actions, options, & directions visible or easily retrievable

[H2-7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use]

- accelerators for experts (e.g., gestures, kb shortcuts)
- allow users to tailor frequent actions (e.g., macros)

[H2-8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design]

- no irrelevant information in dialogues

[H2-9: Help Users Recognize, Diagnose, & Recover from Errors]

- error messages in plain language
- precisely indicate the problem
- constructively suggest a solution

[H2-10: Help & Documentation]

- easy to search
- focused on the user's task
- list concrete steps to carry out

- not too large