

Heuristic Evaluation of Team Boba

1. Problem

Travel Teddy is a travel companion for kids that allows them to interact positively with technology and be productively occupied.

2. Violations Found

1. [H2-1] Visibility of Status [Severity 1] [Evaluator A]

When creating content for others to pack, I think a progress bar would be very helpful for users to have. Since this would be a new process, just giving them a sense of how far along they are would no doubt extremely useful. To fix this, I would add a progress bar letting them know what stage they've completed.

2. [H2-1 Visibility of System Status] [Severity 3] [Evaluator B]

Feedback for cards that have already been selected when packing content (e.g green outline) to give the user a sense of successful interaction

3. [H2-2] Match System and World [Severity 1] [Evaluator A]

In the "Rate Content" screen, I was a bit thrown off by having the happy faces on the left and the sad faces on the right. In most of the systems I've used in my daily life, the scale goes from bad (left) to (good). To fix this, I would suggest reversing the order.

4. [H2-2: Match between system & real world] [Severity 2] [Evaluator C]

Radius is used in real world maps to indicate accuracy of location not the extent of the location. I left wondering why I need accuracy. Change the circle to some other icon so that there is no conflict.

5. [H2-3] User Control and Freedom [Severity 2] [Evaluator A]

I found having to type the content for a new card out of place, as it seemed more useful to be able to narrate the content as you drove by - this would make it the most authentic and real time. To fix this, I would add the option of dictation, as I think this would make the cards more interesting for the children to listen to.

6. [H2-3: User control & freedom] [Severity 4] [Evaluator C]

I want to just change the pin location. When I press back, I am going all the way back to before map was chosen. Use Back to just go to previous screen.

7. [H2-3: User control & freedom] [Severity 2] [Evaluator C]

I may want to tag the content only I plan to share. Do not force the user to the tag screen.

8. [H2-4: Consistency & standards][Severity 2] [Evaluator C]

In the rest of the screens 'action' buttons are highlighted from the surrounding text descriptions. Here 'Ok' button not highlighted. Add button similar to 'confirm' on other screen.

9. [H2-4: Consistency & standards] [Severity 1] [Evaluator C]

The action button 'TIPS' follows a different format than the other action button. Have white space above TIPS and stick to one format for buttons.

10. [H2-4] Consistency and Standards [Severity 3] [Evaluator A]

After pressing the edit button, a trash can pops up in the middle of the screen, which is a confusing screen to be presented with - in most apps, editing involves changing, not deleting. To fix this, I would move the trash can to the bottom of the screen or at least away from the center so that the trip can be canceled or edited without the trashcan being obtrusive.

11. [H2-4] Consistency and Standards [Severity 3] [Evaluator A,B,C]

The colors in this app are not consistent, and the changes make me pause and try to understand what they mean. For example, when reviewing a trip the header becomes brown, which I assume is because it is supposed to evoke the feel of flipping through a scrapbook. Similarly, the cards are a light blue and the location icons are a burnt orange. While aesthetically pleasing, the different colors made me

think about why these changes had taken place. To fix this, I would stick to the original 3 colors used when packing the content - though repetitive, the user doesn't have to decode what is happening.

12. [H2-4] Consistency and Standards [Severity 1] [Evaluator A]

On the map page, there are some stars that seem out of place - they don't map to any of the location icons, and I was confused about whether those were previous destinations. To fix this, I would remove the stars or give a dialog box explaining their significance.

13. [H2-4] Consistency and Standards [Severity 2] [Evaluator A]

On the page giving information about the trips, the information inputted about locations has been changed in a way that could be confusing. For example, the state information has been removed - though not an issue for locals, this could be disorienting for tourists. In addition, changing San Francisco to SF could also be confusing. To fix this, I would suggest using the full location name.

14. [H2-4 Consistency & Standards] [Severity 1] [Evaluator B]

The "back" text buttons are inconsistent colors although they all lead back to the same home screen

15. [H2-4 Consistency and Standards] [Severity 3] [Evaluator B]

The "Start trip icon" is the same as the icon that brings a user to all trips menu - differentiate between these

16. [H2-5 Error Prevention] [Severity 3] [Evaluator B, C]

During the "packing content task", it is unclear if a card swipe right equates to clicking on the green luggage button or if it is just a card skip. It feels like a swipe rather than click gesture.

17. [H2-5] Error Prevention [Severity 3] [Evaluator A,C]

The trash can on each of the cards is a little confusing, as I wasn't sure what it would do. I wasn't sure whether it would delete the card from the trip, or delete the card from ever returning as an option. To fix this, I would suggest opening a dialog box when the user clicks on the trash can to alert them of the consequences.

18.[H2-6] Recognition Rather than Recall [Severity 4] [Evaluator A, B]

The icons on the first screen are not immediately understandable - as I was going through the first task, I was not sure whether to choose the wrench or the pencil. Other users would have to remember what icon matches what command, which would not be an intuitive user experience. To fix, I would potentially use a (+) for a new journey and a wrench for editing a current journey.

19.[H2-6: Recognition rather than recall][Severity 2] [Evaluator C]

I went to ahead to press Ok without much reading the text. It contains crucial information of suggesting me to pack 3 items which I only realized later. Restructure description and highlight number 3.

20.[H2-7] Flexibility and Efficiency of Use [Severity 3] [Evaluator A]

I think adding settings for common driving times or favorite trips could be very useful. This would help the user more easily launch a trip - for example, on the way to school every morning, the app could automatically begin a trip and then a parent wouldn't have to be stressed on a daily commute. To fix this, I would suggest adding fields such as "Favorite Trips" and "Common Commute Times."

21.[H2-8 Aesthetic & Minimalist Design] [Severity 2] [Evaluator B]

The gray trash icon in the bottom corner of the content cards is hard to discern from the cards' blue backgrounds.

22.[H2-8 Aesthetic & Minimalist Design] [Severity 2] [Evaluator B, C]

On the "packing content" app screen, the "Back" written in blue text is hard to make out on green background

23.[H2-8 Aesthetic & Minimalist Design] [Severity 2] [Evaluator B]

The Save button under Review Trip screen seems unnecessary because the user is not initially in an edit mode (only after they click an edit button)

24.[H2-8: Aesthetic & minimalist design] [Severity 1] [Evaluator C]

On the screen where you can end the trip, the cross is aesthetically displeasing. Stick to the swipe.

25.[H2-8: Aesthetic & minimalist design] [Severity 1] [Evaluator C]

I came to this screen with the intention of editing. Edit button was remote and not noticeable. Take me directly to edit screen.

26.[H2-8] Aesthetic and Minimalist Design [Severity 2] [Evaluator A,B,C]

On the "Pack Content" page, the Home icon and the X icon are a bit confusing - I thought pressing the home button would take me back to the start and I also thought that pressing the X would cancel the trip. To fix this issue, I think having Start and Finish/Destination buttons would be more intuitive.

27.[H2-8] Aesthetic and Minimalist Design [Severity 2][Evaluator A]

When giving instructions for packing the content, the color of the instruction tile is a bit confusing - normally, we associate yellow tiles with cautionary statements or warnings. To fix this issue, I would use a different, more neutral color and make this a norm across the entire application.

28.[H2-8] Aesthetic and Minimalist Design [Severity 4] [Evaluator A,B,C]

The turquoise line on the map is hard to discern, and without seeing the black location pins, I would not have noticed that the path was traced. To fix this, I would add a black/red/yellow line.

29.[H2-8] Aesthetic and Minimalist Design [Severity 3] [Evaluator A]

On the summary page for your created trips, I think that the design might draw attention towards the wrong elements. For example, the add button is the first

thing a user sees. I think it might be more useful to see the map more clearly as well as add information about the locations. To fix this, I would suggest making the add button smaller and putting it at the bottom of the page, below the summaries of the trips. In addition, I would make the map wider horizontally so that it is easier to see an overview of the trip.

30.[H2-8: Aesthetic & minimalist design] [Severity 2] [Evaluator C]

When I wanted to start the trip, I directly want to start packing the content. This makes the adjacent screen redundant. Remove the screen, that way users will also get the idea that they have to pack the content for the very first time they see this.

31.[H2-9: Help users recognize, diagnose, & recover from errors] [Severity 1] [Evaluator C]

Instruction to pinch occurs later. Once user drops the pin, remove that help and put the pinch instruction instead of bottom.

32. [H2-9: Help users recognize, diagnose, & recover from errors] [Severity 1] [Evaluator C]

Although pinning is familiar to users, marking a territory may be not. A help button adjacent to pinch dialogue helps.

33.[H2-10] Help and Documentation [Severity 2] [Evaluator A]

When rating the cards, it's not immediately apparent what our comments will do - do they go straight to the creators of the card? Are the cards hidden or shown based on our reviews? I think this would be extremely helpful, and would suggest adding a dialog box that pops up when you first rate a card.

3. Summary of Violations

Category	# Viol. (sev 0)	# Viol. (sev 1)	# Viol. (sev 2)	# Viol. (sev 3)	# Viol. (sev 4)	# Viol. (total)

CS 147 Autumn 2015: Assignment 9 (Heuristic Evaluation Group Template)

Instructor: James Landay

[H2-1: Visibility of Status]		1		1		2
[H2-2: Match Sys & World]		1	1			2
[H2-3: User Control]			2		1	3
[H2-4: Consistency]		3	2	3		8
[H2-5: Error Prevention]				2		2
[H2-6: Recognition not Recall]			1		1	2
[H2-7: Efficiency of Use]				1		1
[H2-8: Minimalist Design]		2	6	1	1	10
[H2-9: Help Users with Errors]		2				2
[H2-10: Documentation]			1			1
Total Violations by Severity	0	9	13	8	3	33
Note: check your answer for the green box by making sure the sum of the last column is equal to the sum of the last row (not including the green box)						

4. Evaluation Statistics

Severity / Evaluator	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C
sev. 0	0	0	0
sev. 1	3	2	5
sev. 2	5	4	7
sev. 3	4	4	3
sev. 4	2	2	3
total (sev. 3 & 4)	6	6	6
total (all severity levels)	14	12	18

5. Summary Recommendations

We appreciated TravelTeddy's simple and minimalistic approach for a medium-fi prototype. Below are some overarching recommendations we have:

Aesthetics: The group could make some general color and aesthetic improvements - especially with color choices for small text and icons that will stand out and improve visibility. Having a more specific color scheme of at most 3 or 4 colors would help users think about the content of the app as opposed to its superficial colors. Every new color draws attention. But since most of the UI is information or action (except for the status pins when you pack the content), sticking to a color scheme that enhances the difference between these two types of UI but which does not differentiate among actions itself is more minimalistic.

In addition, the design should move to rounded, soft corners for the cards and buttons. As iOS design guidelines have progressed, it has become more standard to have rounded buttons and rounded text panes in general. We would suggest migrating towards that design style in order to make your app seamlessly enter the current ecosystem of apps in the AppStore.

Task Flows. As busy parents, individuals are going to want to be able to speed through this app as quickly as possible, which is why using intuitive and informative icons and graphics is going to be very important. We felt that each task flow had a corresponding icon from the home screen, but the icons used did not yet fully convey which task they represented. For example, we did not understand the scrapbook metaphor right away, but we did once we clicked on the icon and realized what it was. Perhaps a metaphor that was more closely tied with trips/transportation would be suitable here.

A major difficulty was the conceptual model of how the 'Back' functionality worked. Evaluator C repeatedly thought of it as something which would help go back to the last screen visited and correct/change something. But the prototype always takes the user to the home screen which may increase the user's frustration as the person needs to re-enter the information.

We really enjoyed your app and are super excited to see where it goes!